Appendix A. (Revised September 2021)

Comparison of Forest Carbon Programs - 8/16/2021

Source: The Forestry Source Forestry Source September 2021 (mydigitalpublication.com)

Data in this chart have been compiled to show the various forest carbon programs that offer services geared toward small landowners. While some programs are in full operation, others are still in their early stages of roll-out. Please note that the data provided below are self-reported by the companies listed in the chart.

Program*	Silviaterra/Natural Capital Exchange (NCAPX)	Family Forest Carbon Program	Forest Carbon Works	Bluesource
Lead Organization(s)	NCX	The American Forest Foundation and The Nature Conservancy	Forest Carbon Works	Bluesource
Partners	Microsoft, Union Square Ventures, Version One, others	Funding Partners: Amazon.com, USFS, NRCS, Doris Duke Charitable Foundation. Technical Partners: Vermont FPR, Audubon Vermont, Vermont Woodlands Association, Vermont Tree Farm	AXA Impact Fund	Over 100 unique voluntary offset buyers and dozens of land conservation NGOs
Description	Transactional marketplace that allows sellers and buyers to submit bids and offers which are matched periodically. Platform is built over Silviaterra's Basemap technology which claims to be able to measure every tree on every acre every year.	The program provides incentive payments to eligible family forest owners (30-2,400 acres) to implement sustainable forestry practices that increase carbon sequestration and timber production. Carbon produced from land enrolled in the program is available for purchase in the form of verified carbon credits.	Landowners with a minimum of 40 acres are eligible for no-cost, no fees for participants. Completes free carbon inventories of properties to determine eligibility and pays landowners annually for sequestering carbon.	Bluesource serves as a contingent fee, environmental attribute developer. Once a landowner hires them, Bluesource funds the full cost of project development and is only compensated once credits are issued and sold. They have applied this method across 70+ projects in the US and Canada covering 2.6M acres. They have sold approximately 1.0M voluntary forestry offsets per year in recent years
Standard	Verra - unverified	Verra – nearing verification	California Air Resources Board; Verified	Has used CAR IFM, CAR ACR, Verra IFM, CAR grasslands IFM, California ARB IFM, and ACR IFM. Most common methodology/standard today is ACR IFM
Carbon Project Type(s)	Deferred Harvest	Improved Forest Management	Improved Forest Management	IFM predominantly.

^{*} Also check out Finite Carbon program called CORE carbon at www.corecarbon.com

Practices or Services Funded	Landowners receive payments for deferring all or some of their harvest over the next 12 months.	1. Growing Mature Forests: promotes the growth of larger, higher quality trees by limiting harvesting over a 20-year contract period, in line with the landowner's management plan. 2. Enhancing Future Forests: promotes regeneration of new forests by having the landowner reduce competing vegetation following or preceding a regeneration harvest. *Specific to Pennsylvania and subject to change in Vermont	Forest Carbon Works membership benefits include: fully funded project development including inventory, verification, marketing, monitoring, and reporting; forestry services including forest management planning and harvest guidance; estate planning and conservation easement assistance and planning.	Landowners receive payments based on actual credits generated. Credits generated = the difference between landowner's management and a common practice baseline less deductions for uncertainty, leakage, and buffer pool contributions.
Term	1-year project term	Landowners commit to 10 - 20 year agreements, depending on the practice. Growing Mature Forests: 20-year contract. Enhancing the Future Forests: 10-year contract. A permanent conservation easement if not required. The program meets market permanence requirements at the landscape level through aggregation of many landowners across a region and through practices that incentivize a shift to more productive and sustainable management in the long run.	25-year crediting period and a 100- year monitoring period. 25-year crediting periods are renewable up to two times (75 years total)	ACR IFM methodology requires a 40 year commitment to maintain stocking at the level which the land owner has received credits for. Bluesource's contract with the landowner starts at 10 years but can be renewed.
Potential Revenue	\$8-10 per acre (estimated)	\$100-\$215 per acre over the life of the contract, depending on the practice. *Specific to Pennsylvania and subject to change in Vermont	Payments for viable projects range from \$10 per acre per year to \$100+ per acre per year. Members receive annual payments during 6 year periods with the options to renew over the 25-year crediting period.	Approximately \$150 - \$1000 per acre over ten years depending on stocking. Bluesource will provide free feasibility assessments for high probability projects
Geography	Southeast U.S. in 2021, continental U.S. thereafter.	A pilot is underway in northwest and central Pennsylvania. Expanding throughout Central Apps, New England, and Northwoods of the Upper Midwest in 2021.	Entire U.S. excluding Hawaii and parts of Alaska. Projects are currently underway in Oregon, Vermont, and Maine. Inventories have been completed in 15 states.	Forested lands in the US and Canada
Type of Support	There is no cost to landowners. NCAPX simply matches buyers and sellers, manages payments, and performs annual measurement.	Funding (incentive payments to implement practices) and expert assistance with project development, forest management planning, verification	Forest Carbon Works membership benefits include fully funded project development including inventory, verification, marketing, monitoring, and reporting; forestry services including forest management planning and harvest guidance; estate planning and conservation easement assistance.	No cost to landowners

Who is Eligible?	All forest owners.	Family forest owners with 30-2,400 acres	Landowners owning a minimum of 40 acres. Premium Membership options available for landowners owning 1,200+ acres	Landowners with 5000 acres of more. This may drop to 1000 acres depending on new ACR small forest owner protocol. OR landowners who aggregate their holdings with an intermediary via a 40 year timber deed to reach 5000 acres.
Link	silviaterra.com/ncapx	forestfoundation.org/family-forest- carbon-program-familyforestcarbon. org	forestcarbonworks.org	bluesource,com
More Information	First transactions expected in March 2021.		inquire@forestcarbonworks.com	
Contact	Jeff Wright jeff@silviaterra.com 843-575-9916	Jim Shallow jim.shallow@tnc.org 802-229-4425 x104	Sarah Ford, Regional Forester sarahf@forestcarbonworks.com 802-391-3133	Aaron Paul 207-837-2571 apaul@bluesource.com

Updated by Tim Stout — Northam Forest Carbon / Doug Baston — Maine Woodlands Owners Assoc Please contact Tim Stout @ stoutim@gmail.com or 617-889-1011 with any questions. 15-Aug-21